CHAPTER 6
RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION

Learning Objectives

After you have read this chapter, you should be able to:
• identify different ways that labour markets can be identified and approached
• discuss the advantages and disadvantages of internal versus external recruiting
• identify internal and external methods of recruiting
• list and discuss a number of hiring alternatives
• explain the HR department's role in the selection process
• diagram and discuss the sequence of a typical selection process
• discuss several types of selection interviews and some key considerations when conducting these interviews
• discuss the merits of references
• describe the various decision strategies for selection
• explain how legal concerns impact on both recruitment and selection

Chapter Outline

1. The recruitment process
2. Recruitment strategies in a diverse workforce
3. Labour market information
   o Labour market sources
   o Operation of the labour market
4. Recruitment sources
   o Internal applicants
   o External applicants
5. Methods of recruitment
   o Internal recruitment methods
   o External recruitment methods
6. Hiring alternatives
   o Assigning overtime
   o Temporary help
   o Leasing employees
7. Recruitment and the law
8. Selection
9. An HR responsibility
10. Selection and the law
11. The selection process
12. Steps in the selection process
    o Initial screening
    o Application blank
    o Pre-employment testing
13. The selection decision
14. Record keeping

**Teaching Tips**

The general purpose of recruitment and selection is to add labour to the workforce. Factors influencing the recruitment and selection process include government laws, labour shortages, technology, and cost.

Students should be encouraged to discuss different staffing methods with which they are familiar. For example, the Internet has had a tremendous impact on employee recruitment processes. Lead students in a discussion of the use of the Internet as a recruitment tool and the impact of Internet-generated responses on systems and workload in the HR office. Another staffing method involves the use of different staffing models. To avoid the cost of hiring additional full-time permanent employees, employers are increasingly turning to other methods of adding labour such as assigning additional overtime, temporary help employees, and employee leasing. In the second part of the chapter, selection is discussed.

It is suggested that the class first discuss how important the selection process is to the organisation. They should be encouraged to give examples (from their own experience) of how one or a few individuals have been critical to the success or failure of an organisation. The next section focuses on discussing the general purpose of the process. The overall view of how all of the steps in the process can be useful in developing a complete picture of the applicant should be stressed. Also an accurate estimation of their ability and motivation to successfully perform the job needs to be stressed because students often do not realise this purpose of the process. The importance and difficulty of estimating an applicant's future motivation is often not appreciated or easily understood by students. Students also do not easily understand that seldom is it possible to identify the "one best person" for the job, so then the HR professional must make sure the selection process provides finalists who could all successfully perform the job. Also, students often do not consider that the termination of a "wrong hire" can be difficult, expensive, time-consuming and possibly harmful to the morale of others.
CASE STUDY

Sunnyside University

Sunnyside University principal, John Fox, had decided that the traditional method of selecting academic staff had not been successful. In the past 20 years, when a department had an open position, the head would attend the regional conference of the appropriate discipline and place a position announcement with the placement service. Interested candidates at the conference would contact the head and request an initial interview. These professional meetings provided a placement process as a service to universities. The head would then return to the campus with curriculum vitae and interview notes on several candidates. The Department Executive Committee would review this applicant pool and select three to five candidates to be invited to the campus for a formal interview. After all the interviews, an offer was made to the top-rated (by the Executive Committee) candidate. If it was turned down, the offer was extended to the second choice, and so on. Candidates were rated by each Executive Committee member on three factors, with the following weights: (1) teaching interests (specific graduate and undergraduate courses), 40%; (2) research interests and publication record, 40%; (3) quality of doctorate training and fit with departmental needs, 20%. The weighted rating determined each candidate’s aggregate score.

Principal Fox had several problems with the traditional process, and as a former chief executive officer of a local bank, he was inclined to question it. His specific concerns were the following:

- The process had produced several staff members who were not outstanding teachers. Some had poor communication skills; many were satisfactory, but few were outstanding. Fox considered teaching to be the highest priority of the university and research and community service the other two important priorities.
- The cost per hire had averaged R10 000 per position largely because of the expenses related to bringing several candidates to the campus.
- Many staff members hired under this process were unable to work effectively in the community in either the private or non-profit sector. Since Sunnyside was an urban community, Fox considered active community involvement to be an important role of everyone employed at the university.
• The process had produced a staff complement that contained only 20% women (white, black, coloured or Asian) and 4% disabled people. Fox had set university diversity goals of 40% women and 20% disabled for each job classification, including academic staff.

Principal Fox has assembled a task force to consider the recruitment and selection process. The task force consists of four students, four academic staff members and two administrators. Fox has given the task force responsibility for developing a new department selection process that will address all of his concerns and hire top-quality academic staff.

**Questions and Answer to Case: Sunnyside University**

**Question 1: How should the task force proceed to address the change?**

**Answer:** The task force should first contact a variety of people at more progressive universities, private agencies and HR professionals and ask them to evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of the current system and suggest changes. Second, the task force should determine the laws applicable to selection to make sure any proposed new process is lawful. Third, the task force should ask Principal John Fox to set clear priorities for newly hired faculty. For example, if outstanding teaching is the top priority, effective community service second, and research capabilities third, then the current criteria and minimum qualifications need to be changed.

To generate greater interest in this case the instructor can require the students to ask their own Principal, a random sample of faculty, and themselves what weights at their own campus they would assign to the criteria of teaching, research, and community service and how these should be assessed when hiring new faculty.

**Question 2: Do you agree with Principal Fox that the problems he listed are probably caused by the faculty selection process?**

**Answer:** Yes! The process described is that utilised by many universities and has often led to the problems experienced by Sunnyside University. The over-reliance on the placement services of professional academic organisations at their annual meeting tends to generate a homogeneous pool of applicants and often a modified "old-boy" network selection process.

Specific problems with the current process include: (1) the teaching interests of applicants (courses they prefer) is the primary factor in the 40 percent teaching criteria. What could be required instead is: evidence of an outstanding past record (curriculum innovation, course evaluations, peer reviews, active learning classroom techniques). Thus the principal should not be surprised (concern #1) when poor teachers are hired under the current process; (2) the process attracts a limited pool of applicants - new Ph.Ds who enter the placement service at professional meetings. No effort is made to attract top faculty away from other schools through direct contact by current faculty, direct mailings, etc.; (3) the cost per hire is high (concern
#2) because other techniques which could be used to reduce the number brought to campus are not being used, techniques such as requiring applicants to videotape their answers to questions or themselves teaching a class or conducting a teleconferencing interview. The cost is also high because the selection committee is not required to stay within a budget; (4) the current process does not involve any input from individuals in the business community nor does it give any weighting to applicants' past record of community involvement, thus the principal should not be surprised when faculty hired under this process (concern #3) are unable or unwilling to work effectively in the community; (5) the current process contains no specific effort to recruit a diverse faculty. Again, the principal should not be surprised that diversity has not occurred (concern #4) because it is well-known that today universities must develop innovative diversity programmes because the number of diverse applicants is still small.

Question 3: Design a recommended selection process that would meet Principal Fox's concerns. Consider using each of the selection methods discussed in the chapter. Be specific about what stakeholder groups (faculty, students, community representatives, alumni, etc.) should be included in using each method.

Answer: While students may present a variety of effective processes, one productive student group at the university presented the following:

Selection committee:
- Committee chair: Department Chair
- Members: 2 faculty, 1 alumni, 1 student, 1 community representative

Recruitment methods: (to provide applicant pool)
1. professional meetings (current method)
2. regional newspapers and relevant professional newsletters
3. faculty referral programme (awards to those faculty who recruit finalists)
4. disadvantaged group faculty development programme which recruits MBAs from the disadvantaged group with experience and provides incentives for them to attend a Ph.D. programme while teaching part-time.

Recruitment steps:
1. Applicants must provide:
   a. CV & references including 3 peers, 3 former students and 1 from the community
   b. videotape of (1) their answers to a set of questions (from the committee) and (2) a class which they are currently teaching
   c. copies of three publications, paper presentations, or works in progress
2. The committee will select five finalists.

3. The committee will conduct background checks on each applicant with each committee member calling one reference from each applicant, thus each gets a contact on each finalist.

4. The top 2-3 (if that many finalists are still in the running) are invited to campus. The campus visit will include interviews by (1) department faculty, (2) students, alumni, and (3) community representatives. All interviewers will provide a written scored evaluation on the finalists on the following criteria:

   a. teaching ability
   b. communication skills
   c. research ability
   d. community service ability
   e. motivation

5. The chair will total the scores and provide the total, the individual evaluations, and an overall committee ranking to the dean for a final decision. If no applicant is selected, a new group of finalist may be selected from the pool or a new search may be conducted.

**Question 4: How should Principal Fox determine whether the new process you proposed (question 3) has been effective after a five-year trial period?**

**Answer:** The Principal should set specific measurable criteria before the beginning of the process which address each concern, for example:

1. 80 percent or more of the new hires are judged by students and faculty to be outstanding teachers after two years of classroom experience.

2. The average cost per hire was less than R10,000 (direct expenses only such as travel, lodging, meals).

3. 80 percent or more of the new hires were evaluated as providing satisfactory community service in their second year annual report.

4. At least 50 percent of the new hires were women and at least 20 percent from the other members of the disadvantaged group (within each college).

**CASE STUDY**

**Unfair discrimination at Batho-Pele Air?**

Tebogo Mashego was recently appointed as the HR manager at a local airline company. One day her assistant brings her a copy of an advertisement the company had used the previous year for the position of a flight attendant. She is planning to place a similar
advertisement in a local newspaper shortly, as the company is introducing additional flights
and needs to employ more flight attendants. The advertisement appears below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FLIGHT ATTENDANT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Batho-Pele Air is a local airline based in Gauteng. The company is looking for flight
   attendants to man flights between Johannesburg, Cape Town and Durban. |
| You may qualify if you meet the following criteria:
  • You have work experience in a customer service environment.
  • You are between 163 cm and 183 cm in height.
  • You are able to attend a 6–7-week full-time training programme.
  • You are willing to travel.
  • You are in possession of a level 2 first-aid certificate from a recognised
    service provider.
  • You have your own reliable transport. |
| For more information, contact May Grant on 011 456-7890 or at may.grant@batho-
   peleair.co.za. |
| Kindly submit your CV, copies of your ID and qualifications before 30 June 2010 to
  the e-mail address above or fax a copy to 086 345 6789. |

The assistant asks Tebogo to approve the advertisement. As a recent graduate Tebogo is fully
aware of the impact that the labour legislation has on HR and as such she proceeds to
evaluate the abovementioned carefully.

Questions and Answers to Case: Unfair discrimination at Batho-Pele Air?

Question 1: Discuss the content of the advertisement on the basis of the
South African labour legislation.

Answer: Chapter 6

For the flight attendant position, the company is allowed to specify requirements
such as the height of the candidates, since aircraft have limited space on board. In
this case, therefore, the requirement is acceptable and in line with the legislation, as
it can be seen as an inherent job requirement.

It would probably be advisable for the company to include some information about
the remuneration package: the advertisement need not specify the salary offered, but it could include a sentence stating that the company offers market-related remuneration packages and benefits. The wording in the advertisement can also be looked at as some of the aspects can be seen as sexist, they can perhaps rather use the words “work on” rather than “man” flights. In the case of flight attendants certain requirements can be set such as the requirement of candidates to have their own reliable transport. The flight attendants have to arrive at work on time for their flights. The company can also require their staff to attend compulsory training and to be in possession of the required first aid training qualifications as this is an inherent job requirement. The company might also give preference to applicants from designated groups or people from disadvantaged groups and this should then also be stated clearly in the advertisement.

Question 2: Would this advertisement also be applicable to the job of a secretary at the airline? Explain your answer.

Answer: Chapter 6

No, the advertisement contains job-specific aspects that apply only to the job of a flight attendant. For example, the height of the candidate is irrelevant in the case of a secretary, as this has no influence on whether the person can do the job or not. The advertisement may be used as a basis for the secretary’s position, but a number of aspects will have to be changed. A job description for the secretarial job, as well as qualifications and experience required, will need to be included. It would also be advisable to mention specific requirements, such as the computer software packages that this person should be familiar with and the typing speed required. Again, as in the case of the advertisement for the flight attendant’s position, no specific salary needs to be mentioned, but there should be some reference to the remuneration for the secretary’s post.

Question 3: Using the principles of a good advertisement, compile an advertisement for a secretarial position at Batho-Pele Air.

Answer: Chapter 6

SECRETARY

Batho-Pele Air is a local airline based in Gauteng. The Company is looking for a secretary for the Johannesburg office. The secretary will be working directly with the Managing Director. The airline is seeking a dynamic person with initiative to join the fast-growing company. Batho-Pele Air offers a market-related remuneration package and benefits.

The successful candidate should be in possession of the following:
- a 3-year secretarial diploma
- at least 2 years’ secretarial experience at senior management level
- good computer skills, specifically MS Word, Outlook, PowerPoint and Excel
- a typing speed of at least 80 words per minute
The following aspects are key in answering this question. The advertisement must be attractive and the company logo should be included. The closing date and contact details should also be included. The JD and JS information should be included in a condensed format to ensure that applicants know exactly what the company expects. If there are any specific skills that the successful candidate should possess, this should also be included, for example the software packages that the person should be familiar with, the typing speed required and minute taking skills.

**Question 4:** Would you recommend that Batho-Pele Air make use of other external recruitment methods, rather than advertising in a newspaper for the position of a flight attendant? If so, which alternatives could they consider? Give reasons for your answer. If not, also give reasons for your answer.

**Answer:** Section 6.5.2

Direct applications are an option, but care should be taken as this method might exclude some candidates. Under the present economic circumstances, this method might also pose a problem for the company: owing to the high unemployment rate, they might receive an unusually large number of applications, which may be difficult to process. They could consider employee referrals, but once again, some candidates may be excluded in the process, posing a problem in light of the labour legislation. University/campus recruiting is not an option – unless the students have worked part-time while studying – as the company needs applicants with experience in customer service. Employment agencies are also an option but as they are too expensive for this level of job it is not recommended; however, it might save the company some time. Direct mail is not an option as the position is not that
specialised. Radio/TV and internet advertising is also not an option, as radio and TV advertisements are too expensive for this level of job. The company could consider advertising on the internet, but once again, they might not reach their target market as computer skills are not an inherent job requirement for flight attendants and therefore potential candidates might not see the advertisement. Billboards and posters also are not an option, since the company does not have an ongoing need for hiring flight attendants.

**Experiential Exercises**

1. **THE TEMPORARY HELP ALTERNATIVE**

**Purpose**
To gain an understanding of the temporary help alternative as a method of increasing personnel.

**The task**
Contact five temporary help agencies and ask each to provide the following information for each of the positions listed:

1. Their charge for one week (40 hours)
2. The number of people with at least one year's experience they have available
3. How quickly an employee could be provided.

If additional information is needed, improvise.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Cost/week</th>
<th>No. Available</th>
<th>When available</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Secretary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(experience: WordPerfect, Lotus 1-2-3)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Cashier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Salesperson (experienced in retail clothing)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Accountant (BCom/BCompt)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Driver (heavy-duty driver's licence, experience with delivery trucks)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. **EFFECTIVE ADS**

**Purpose**
To understand the criteria for evaluating recruiting advertisements and the effectiveness of several actual ads.

**Introduction**
What are the characteristics of effective ads? Consider the following questions and
do's and don'ts.

**Who do you want?**
Important information that you will need *before* you write your ad:

- How many people do you need?
- What skills and abilities are required?
- Is this person likely to be working and, if so, where?
- What publications is this person likely to read regularly?
- Which job rewards - compensation, benefits, career opportunities, and so on - is this person likely to be looking for?
- How competitive is the market for this person?
- What is the probable level of job satisfaction the person has with his or her present job?

Once you have answered these basic questions, you will need to create a strategy for effectively communicating the challenges and opportunities of the available job.

**Some do's and don'ts**

- **Headlines are important.** Use a distinctive headline to sell the job to the candidate. Don't just list the job title.
- **Use graphics carefully.** Advert graphics vary widely, ranging from the simple to the complex. Graphics that are confusing or misleading are worse than no graphics at all, so make sure that graphics make sense. A basic question to ask is: do the graphics convey a message that you want to communicate?
- **Don't misrepresent the job.** Don't make promises you cannot keep. Be honest about opportunities for advancement, challenge, responsibility, and so on. Honesty is the best policy.
- **Don't be vague.** Be specific about the job title, salary range and closing date.
- **'Sell' the employee.** Without tooting your own company horn too loudly, make sure the ad contains the benefits of working for your firm.
- **Avoid stereotypes.** Beware of sexism, racism and other stereotypes. Make sure that the ad will not be seen as offensive to anyone.
- **Help prospective candidates identify themselves.** To avoid sifting through countless CVs, define the qualifications you are looking for. You will cut down considerably on unqualified applicants if you specify the three to five key requirements and be specific - e.g. 'Experience as the manager of ten or more industrial salespeople for at least three years'.
- **Use advertising space economically.** Space is not cheap. Don't use a full-page ad when a half-page ad will do the job just as effectively. Don't use too many graphics and too little prose; conversely, don't use a space so small that the applicant will get eyestrain from reading. The size of the ad should be in proportion to the size of the firm, importance of the position, number of candidates sought, and so on.
- **Select recruitment media carefully.** Study the reading habits of potential candidates to determine what they read. Also, study the readership demographics of the various media you are considering. A great-looking ad is no good if the right people are not reading it.
The task
Illustrated on the next few pages are a number of advertisements. All were taken from the same newspaper during 2009 over a number of Sundays. Using the criteria listed, evaluate each ad, using the grid provided. Your instructor will lead you in a discussion of the results of your analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion*</th>
<th>Advertisement</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Distinctive headlines</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective graphics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clever and creative</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoids sounding too glamorous</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specifies nature of job and qualifications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'Sells' the employee</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoids stereotyping</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helps candidates identify self</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uses space economically</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective typeface</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proper recruitment medium</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Totals

*Rank each ad for each criterion using the following scale. Ranking (most effective to least effective) (5 = Excellent; 4 = Very good; 3 = Satisfactory; 2 = Below average; 1 = Very poor)

Source: Adapted from Margaret Magnus, 'Recruitment ads at work'. 8 Copyright August, 1985. Reprinted with the permission of Personnel Journal, Costa Mesa, CA. All rights reserved.
3 INTERVIEWER PERSPECTIVES

Purpose
To recognise the difficulty of conducting effective job interviews and to learn how several interviewers can reach different conclusions on the same applicants.

The task
The class should be divided into groups of three to five students. An even number of groups is required. Each group will assume the roles of HR professionals or job applicants.

Step 1: Members of each HR group will write a brief job description based on a job with which they have some familiarity.

Step 2: The job description developed by the HR group will be given to members of the applicant group, who will then study it and prepare themselves for a job interview. The instructor may wish to allow one or two days to pass before step 3, for the applicants to prepare themselves.

Step 3: Members of the HR group will prepare a list of interview questions to ask the applicants and a list of criteria that they will use to score the interview.

Step 4: The HR group will interview each applicant (other applicants should be out of the room) and individually score the applicant after the interview is completed.

Step 5: All members of each pair of HR and applicant groups will review the interview scores together. Each HR member should be required to explain or defend his or her scoring.

Step 6: If the class contains multiple pairs of groups, one representative of each pair will lead a discussion of the activities of their session.

Answers to Experiential Exercises

1. THE TEMPORARY HELP ALTERNATIVE

Purpose
To gain an understanding of the temporary help alternative as a method of increasing personnel.

Students should be directed to contact agencies (up to five) within the same labour market to provide comparative data. The instructor, however, might encourage students individually or in teams, to contact firms in different labour markets, so firms in one market are not contacted by several students.

Once the information is obtained the class should discuss (1) the similarity of the costs, number of people available, and when they are available; (2) their thoughts on the information obtained; and (3) if the exercise changed their attitude toward utilising temporary help.
2. EFFECTIVE HELP-WANTED ADS

Purpose
To understand the criteria for evaluating help-wanted recruiting advertisements and the effectiveness of several actual help-wanted ads.

The instructor may want to substitute ads from a local newspaper to give each group of students a different set of ads and thus provide more discussion.

Preliminary Activities
Before conducting this exercise, it may be useful to discuss the role of want ads in the recruiting process. It may also be useful to touch upon the legalities of help-wanted advertising.

Answer: You should expect different ratings on these ads, as the rating process is somewhat subjective. Students should offer justification for their ratings. The grid should be completed as indicated below. This completed grid is not based on any group of advertisements but is purely an example. The most important part of this exercise is the classroom discussion of the strengths and weaknesses of each ad.

Rate each ad for each criterion using the following scale:
5 = Excellent; 4 = Very Good; 3 = Satisfactory; 2 = Below Average; 1 = Very Poor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>Advertisement 1</th>
<th>Advertisement 2</th>
<th>Advertisement 3</th>
<th>Advertisement 4</th>
<th>Advertisement 5</th>
<th>Advertisement 6</th>
<th>Advertisement 7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Distinctive headlines</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective graphics</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clever and creative</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoids sounding too glamorous</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specifies nature of job and qualifications</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Sells&quot; the employee</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoids stereotyping</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helps candidate identify self</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uses space economically</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective typeface</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proper recruitment media</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTALS</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ranking of advertisements (most effective to least effective):
3. INTERVIEWER PERSPECTIVES

This exercise can give students valuable experience in (1) writing job descriptions, (2) preparing and conducting job interviews, (3) being interviewed. The instructor should lead a review discussion of each of the outcomes: (1) the job description, (2) the structured interviews, (3) the actual interviews, (4) the scoring of the interviews. The instructor should require that the job selected be useful for this purpose and if multiple groups are used then only one group should be allowed to use a particular job.

Answers to Review Questions

Question 1: How can an employer recruit a diverse work force?

Answer: While recruiting good applicants has always been challenging, the rapidly changing demographic and economic factors in today's work force requires more flexible and innovative methods to attract: (1) the shrinking number of qualified applicants; (2) the expanding female labour force with differing employment needs; (3) the rapidly growing culturally diverse portion of the labour force; and (4) retirees who are increasingly willing to return to work. Examples of successful employer non-traditional recruitment strategies include:

- Disadvantaged group (designated group) training programmes
- Disadvantaged group (designated group) internships and mentoring programmes
- Career fairs to attract older and female applicants
- "Telecruting" through television
- Diversity data banks
- Retiree, "job bank" to bring back retirees for seasonal, part-time or emergency work
- Relocation assistance programmes to assist dual-career couples
- Recruitment videos aimed at female, disabled or other labour force groups
- Innovative advertising designed to "pirate away" successful disadvantage (designated) employees from other employers

Question 2: Discuss hourly and professional applicants' knowledge of labour markets.

Answer: Applicants for professional positions typically are more familiar with the labour market than applicants for hourly positions. Applicants looking for professional
positions are usually more aware of the market in terms of salary and benefits and also are more willing to relocate and look for jobs in a wider market. Professional position applicants often are of a professional nature and have professional journals and other sources of market information that hourly position applicants do not have. It is more often the case that professional applicants will not leave a position until a new position is found, whereas hourly position applicants often are unemployed between jobs.

**Question 3: What are the advantages of recruiting applicants internally? Externally?**

**Answer:** As discussed in the chapter, internal applicant recruitment has the primary advantage of increasing the morale of all employees because they feel that hard work will be rewarded with eventual promotion. Also, the internally-recruited applicants are familiar with the company’s policies and procedures and know products and services and other important information. Also the company knows the applicants better; they have direct knowledge of their work experience and know they can trust the personal records of the applicants. One opening may result in several other openings as internal applicants are promoted, and therefore a chain effect enables several employees to be promoted. This would, therefore, involve only entry-level hiring by the organisation and not hiring at higher levels applicants who are untried and may make greater mistakes. External applicants, however, offer the advantage of bringing a new method of work, ideas, and concepts to the organisation. Going outside will reduce internal fighting among employees for positions and therefore, minimise the Peter Principle occurrences. Using external applicants gives the organisation a much wider choice of applicants than if they only looked in house.

**Question 4: List the three major methods of job posting. Why should an employer consider a voice-mail system?**

**Answer:** The major methods of job posting include:

1. Traditional bulletin boards or spaces in lunch halls, break rooms, etc.
2. Computer/electronic mail base systems
3. Telephone voice-mail based systems

Voice-mail systems and electronic-mail systems, compared to bulletin boards or similar systems often include the following advantages: (1) easier access by employees; (2) 24 hour availability; (3) less paperwork; and (4) immediate notification to all employees.

**Question 5: Has advertising increased as a recruitment technique in recent years? Why?**

**Answer:** Media advertising, particularly trade journals and other publications as well as local newspapers, has definitely picked up in recent years. One very important reason has been in the area of employment equity. Firms are spending greater amounts of money on advertising to recruit members of the disadvantaged groups
(designated groups) from within and outside the labour market area in which they are located. This often means that there are more ads for the same number of jobs than there were a few years ago. The second primary reason is the realisation by HR specialists that media advertising can be quite successful in attracting a better quality candidate than walk-ins or gate hires.

**Question 6: What are some of the implications for companies recruiting through advertising, as seen from the Employment Equity Act, No 55 of 1998?**

**Answer:** When advertising job vacancies, it is unlawful for employers to publish an advertisement which indicates, or could reasonably be understood as indicating an intention to discriminate against applicants on any of the grounds listed in section 6 (1) of the Act. Advertising mechanisms that reach all realistic candidates for new opportunities including people from disadvantaged groups need to be developed. When advertising a position, employers or recruitment agents may not specify discriminatory criteria such as age, gender, marital status and other personal characteristics. When advertising internally in the staff room it is important that the information is clearly available for all candidates to see. When advertising externally employers and recruitment agents are expected to advertise in newspapers that have a national audience consisting of all groups of people.

**Question 7: Why is the selection process usually centralised in the HR department?**

**Answer:** Centralising the recruitment and selection process in the HR department is both efficient and effective in comparison to a greatly decentralised system. Job applicants as well as current employees have one place to apply for jobs and transfers as well as inquire about the other personnel related matters. More importantly the trained HR specialists ensure the organisation that it receives maximum efforts from its personnel through proper recruitment and selection procedures. More importantly, in recent years the HR specialists ensure the organisation of compliance with government laws.

**Question 8: Should the HR office ask an applicant for his or her date of birth, marital status, or a photograph?**

**Answer:** Employers or recruitment agents may not specify discriminatory criteria such as age, gender, marital status and other personal characteristics.

**Question 9: How does the HR specialist use the application blank?**

**Answer:** The application blank is the permanent record of the individual's application to the organisation and record as employee. The application blank supplies information for employment equity reporting as well as other legal information. The application blank primarily provides the outline of an individual's work history against which the HR specialist develops questions and checks out information concerning the individual.
Question 10: What are the real purposes of background checks?

Answer: Personal references can be used if they are judged carefully by the HR specialist. The quality of the reference, how well the person knows the applicant, and what pertinent job-related information the reference can supply can be valuable information to the HR specialist. Personnel references can also be used to help verify the application blank and other information.
ADDENDUM A TO INSTRUCTOR'S MANUAL

The following documents are included here:

1. Some applications of employment-related tests
2. Types of staffing assessment tools
1. SOME APPLICATIONS OF EMPLOYMENT - RELATED TESTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Application</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Psychological tests</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory</td>
<td>Measures personality or temperament (executives, nuclear power, security)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- California Psychological Inventory</td>
<td>Measures personality or temperament (executives, managers, supervisors)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Guilford-Zimmerman Temperament Survey</td>
<td>Measures personality or temperament (sales personnel)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Watson-Glaser Critical thinking Appraisal</td>
<td>Measures logic and reasoning ability (executives, managers, supervisors)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Owens Creativity Test</td>
<td>Measures creativity and judgement ability (engineers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Myers-Briggs Type Indicator</td>
<td>Measures personality components</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Knowledge tests</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Leadership opinion questionnaire</td>
<td>Measures knowledge of leadership practices (managers and supervisors)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- General aptitude test battery</td>
<td>Measures verbal, spatial, numeric and other aptitudes and dexterity (job seekers at unemployment offices)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Performance tests</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Stromberg Dexterity Test</td>
<td>Measures physical coordination (shop workers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Revised Minnesota Paper</td>
<td>Measures spatial visualisation (draughtsmen and draughtswomen)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Minnesota Clerical Test</td>
<td>Measures ability to work with numbers and names (clerks)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Job simulation tests</td>
<td>Measures a sample of ‘on the job’ demands (managers, professionals)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Graphic response test</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Polygraph (lie detector)</td>
<td>Measures physiological responses to questions (police, retail store workers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aptitude tests</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Honesty test</td>
<td>Measures attitudes about theft and related subjects (retail workers, securities employees, banks)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Work opinion questionnaire</td>
<td>Measures attitudes about work and values (entry-level, low-income workers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Medical tests</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Drug tests</td>
<td>Measures the presence of illegal or performance-affecting drugs (athletes, government employees, equipment operators)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Genetic screening</td>
<td>Identifies genetic predispositions to specific medical problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Medical screening</td>
<td>Measures and monitors exposure to hazardous chemicals (miners, factory workers, researchers)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 2. TYPES OF STAFFING ASSESSMENT TOOLS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assessment Tool</th>
<th>How Does it Evaluate Candidates?</th>
<th>What it Measures</th>
<th>What it Does</th>
<th>Common Limitations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Physical Exams Drug Screens</td>
<td>Use medical screening procedures to detect whether candidates have used illegal or controlled substances (for example, urine analysis, analysis of hair samples).</td>
<td>Identify people who may work under the influence of controlled substances and engage in other counterproductive behaviors associated with drug use</td>
<td>Not useful for predicting superior job performance; Will not identify poor hires who do not use drugs; May be relatively costly compared to other assessments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Ability Tests</td>
<td>Require candidates to perform physical tasks such as lifting weights, completing cardiovascular exercises, or demonstrating flexibility.</td>
<td>Determine whether people can handle physical demands associated with a job</td>
<td>Only relevant for jobs that have a clear and well-defined physical component; May pose legal risks associated with Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) and/or potential adverse impact against women; May be relatively costly compared to other assessments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investigations Criminal Record Checks</td>
<td>Searches public records and private databases to determine whether applicants have any prior criminal convictions.</td>
<td>Identify people with known criminal histories who are more likely to engage in counterproductive behaviour</td>
<td>Not useful for predicting superior job performance; Will not identify poor hires who do not have a criminal record; May be relatively costly compared to other assessments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Security Verification</td>
<td>Searches online databases to ensure that a candidate's Social Security number is valid.</td>
<td>Verify candidate's identity; Comply with regulations related to U.S. and state hiring</td>
<td>Not useful for predicting actual job performance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment Tool</td>
<td>How Does it Evaluate Candidates?</td>
<td>What it Measures</td>
<td>What it Does</td>
<td>Common Limitations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference Checks</td>
<td>Collect information from former employers or academic institutions to verify previous employment status and educational credentials; may also gather information about candidate performance in previous jobs</td>
<td>What people have done</td>
<td>● Verify candidate employment and educational history&lt;br&gt;● Additional source of information about a candidate</td>
<td>Many former employers are reluctant to provide reference information&lt;br&gt;Reference information is often of questionable quality&lt;br&gt;May be relatively costly compared to other assessments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit Reports</td>
<td>Contact credit reporting agencies to obtain information about a candidate's financial history.</td>
<td>What people want to do</td>
<td>● Provide insight into candidate's fiscal responsibility; may be particularly relevant for jobs in which candidates will have direct access to cash</td>
<td>Debate exists about appropriateness of using credit information to evaluate candidates; may be perceived as invasive by candidates&lt;br&gt;May be relatively costly compared to other assessments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resume Screens</td>
<td>Electronic Recruiting Agents</td>
<td>Search the web for qualified candidates based on words found in resumes posted on internal or external career boards.</td>
<td>What people can do</td>
<td>● Can uncover candidates who might have gone unnoticed otherwise&lt;br&gt;● Good for finding candidates with unique skills and qualifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resume Capture and Reviews</td>
<td>Evaluate candidates based on the content of resumes they submit directly to the company or that are posted to web-based job boards.</td>
<td>What people can do</td>
<td>● Good for screening candidates based on unique skills and qualifications</td>
<td>May overlook candidates who have incomplete resumes and overly favour candidates with inflated resumes&lt;br&gt;Can be time-consuming and complex to use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment Tool</td>
<td>How Does it Evaluate Candidates?</td>
<td>What it Measures</td>
<td>Common Limitations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interviews</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unstructured Interviews</td>
<td>Evaluate candidates by having a discussion with them about topics that seem relevant to the job.</td>
<td>What people have done</td>
<td>What people want to do</td>
<td>What people can do</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Depends on the questions used</td>
<td>Depends on the question used</td>
<td>Depends on the question used</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structured Interviews: Motivational Questions</td>
<td>Evaluate candidates by asking pre-defined questions about interests, career goals, and plans.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>All the benefits of unstructured interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structured Interviews: Situational Questions</td>
<td>Evaluate candidates by asking how they would respond to hypothetical situations similar to what they may encounter on the job.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>All the benefits of unstructured interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structured Interviews: Behavioural questions</td>
<td>Evaluate candidates by asking them to describe experiences and accomplishment that relate to things they will have to do on the job.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>All the benefits of unstructured interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self-Report Measures</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Screening Questionnaires Weighted Application Blanks</td>
<td>Ask very direct questions to candidates to determine whether they possess specific skills, experiences, or credentials needed to perform a job (for example, &quot;Are you willing to work...&quot;)</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>Can be an efficient method to screen out poorly qualified candidates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Readily available through many applicant tracking and staffing systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment Tool</td>
<td>How Does it Evaluate Candidates?</td>
<td>What it Measures</td>
<td>Common Limitations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Personality Questionnaires</strong></td>
<td>Ask candidates a series of self-descriptive questions about their likes, preferences, and past experiences that reflect personality traits associated with job performance.</td>
<td><strong>What people have done</strong></td>
<td>• Effective for predicting &quot;soft&quot; aspects of performance related to interpersonal style, emotional stability, attitudes, and motivation.</td>
<td>• May be perceived as invasive or non-job-relevant by candidates. • Difficult to develop; easy to create measures that do not work well.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Integrity and Reliability Tests</strong></td>
<td>Ask candidates about beliefs, preferences, and experiences that reflect a propensity for counterproductive behaviour.</td>
<td><strong>What people want to do</strong></td>
<td>• Useful for screening out applicants likely to engage in theft, drug use, and other highly deviant behaviours.</td>
<td>• Little value for predicting superior job performance. • Only relevant for those jobs in which employee counter-productivity is an issue. • Some questions may offend or insult applicants. • May be subject to legal restrictions in some states.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Biodata Inventories</strong></td>
<td>Ask questions about previous life experiences and accomplishments that show statistical relationships to job performance.</td>
<td><strong>What people can do</strong></td>
<td>• Effective for predicting &quot;soft&quot; aspects of performance such as interpersonal style, emotional stability, attitudes, and motivation.</td>
<td>• May be perceived as invasive or non-job-relevant by candidates. • Difficult to develop; easy to create measures that do not work well.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Culture and Work Environment Fit Inventories</strong></td>
<td>Ask questions about job preferences, values, beliefs, and desired work environment to predict organizational commitment and job satisfaction with a specific job or company.</td>
<td><strong>What it Does</strong></td>
<td>• Can be effective for predicting job satisfaction and tenure.</td>
<td>• Tend to show low relationships to actual job performance. • Difficult to develop; easy to create measures that do not work well.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge, Skill, and Ability Tests</td>
<td>Ability Tests and Measures of Problem-Solving Aptitude</td>
<td>Knowledge and Skills Tests and Measures of Past Learning “Achievement”</td>
<td>Situational Measures Low-Fidelity Job Simulations/ Situational judgment Tests</td>
<td>High-Fidelity Job Simulations/ Assessment Centres/Work Samples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Predict ability to solve problems and interpret information by asking applicants to solve questions that require processing information to arrive at logically based conclusions.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Considered to be the single most accurate type of assessment for predicting job performance. • Particularly valuable for jobs that require ongoing learning, processing complex information, and solving novel problems.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Show adverse impact against certain EEOC protected groups. • Tend to be disliked by applicants.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assess familiarity and mastery with regard to specific types of information or tasks (for example, knowledge of accounting rules, ability to use certain software programs, typing skills.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Useful for determining candidates’ skill level with regard to critical job functions.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• May assess things that could be learned on the job.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ask candidates questions about different hypothetical work situations.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tap into a broad range of job-relevant interests, experiences, and abilities. • Can predict &quot;soft&quot; skills associated with interpersonal behaviour and work style. • Highly job realistic; tend to be favourably received by applicants.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• May only be relevant for a narrow range of jobs. • Can require somewhat more time to administer than measures of personality and ability that may predict the same aspects of job performance.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use audio, video, computer simulations, and/or human actors to recreate actual job situations and then assess how candidates react to these scenarios.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tap into a broad range of job-relevant interests, experiences, and abilities. • Can predict &quot;soft&quot; skills associated with interpersonal behaviour and work style. • Highly job realistic; tend to be favourably received by applicants.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| • Labour-intensive to construct. • May only be relevant for a narrow range of jobs. • Can require considerably more time to administer than other measures of personality and ability that may predict the same aspects of job performance. • Can be very
| Cognitive Task Simulations | Candidates perform simple tasks or "video games" that require the use of skills that influence job performance. | x | - Can be very effective for predicting performance of job tasks that involve processing and reacting to information in real time  
- If designed properly, can be highly engaging for applicants; provide a realistic preview of job activities  
- Relatively unexplored type of assessment  
- Scores on cognitive tasks tend to be related to ability test scores; may show adverse impact |